

**Fourth Meeting of the  
Working Group on Risk Analysis  
of the Regional Commission for the Americas**

**June 25-29, 2001  
San Salvador, El Salvador**

**Participants:**

Alejandro López, PANAFTOSA  
Fernando Leanes, Argentina  
Ken Forsythe, United States  
Randy Morley, Canadá  
Eduardo Serrano, OIRSA  
José Naranjo, Chile

**Observers:**

Steve Weber, United States  
Vincenzo Caporale, Italy  
Donatella Nannini, Italy  
Armando Giovannini, Italy

**Coordinators:**

Emilio Gimeno, Representative for the OIE Region for the Americas  
Cristóbal Zepeda, OIE Collaborating Center for Animal Disease Surveillance and Risk Analysis

**Economic Consequence Evaluation**

The International Animal Health Code considers economic disease impact as part of consequence assessment. The Code mentions:

- Production losses
- Surveillance and control costs
- Indemnification costs
- Potential trade losses
- Environmental damage consequences

The economic consequence assessment should be based on what is established in the code. However, this should not limit a country's ability to broaden the depth on economic consequences. This evaluation could be conducted as a one-time service and should not be repeated for every risk analysis.

The economic consequence evaluation should be practical and not create an obstacle that slows the process unnecessarily. The group recognizes that the economic evaluation process is multidisciplinary and it is necessary to establish adequate ties to include specialists in several areas into the risk analysis process.

Some of the methods that were identified to evaluate the consequences were:

- Partial Budgeting to measure the production losses due to disease at the production unit level.
- Discounting to evaluate the impact of an outbreak in time
- Budgeting to evaluate the compensation and disease surveillance expenses
- Identification of quantity and value of products that would not be exported, taking into consideration the possibility of regionalizing (export data bases and other sources)

Other methods that could be utilized for production and trade loss include:

- Partial equilibrium models
- Multi-Market models

- Input-Output models

A topic that was not discussed was environmental impact, which would require specialists from other disciplines.

The group took note of that social consequences from the implementation of disease control and eradication measures were not explicitly mentioned in the code. However, the recent outbreaks of foot-and-mouth disease in the United Kingdom and South America, point out the necessity to consider these aspects in the future.

The Collaborating Center in Fort Collins has developed a simulation model to evaluate a potential disease outbreak and partially, the economic consequences of a disease outbreak. The group considered that this tool was useful and requested the Collaborating Center to continue developing and expanding the model to include other diseases and to make it accessible to other countries. The group recognized that an important effort was required for the additional development by the Collaborating Center and suggested that the model be presented during the next meeting of the Regional Commission for the Americas with the objective to obtain a recommendation to promote the development and application of the model in the countries.

### **Risk Management**

Although risk management was not the topic of this meeting, the group discussion derived to consider not only the negative aspects of disease introduction but also the positive aspects of trade. However, the group recognized that the elements needed to adequately perform this type of assessment were not available.

### **Relationship between the working group and the Ad Hoc group for the development of the OIE Risk Analysis Manual**

The manual currently being developed for the OIE Ad Hoc Group is geared for the application of risk analysis within the framework of the OIE Code. The work of the Regional Commission of the Americas group provides what are considered "good practices" through published documents. The manual will complement this information as it contains theoretical elements with some qualitative and quantitative examples. The manual should be ready at the beginning of next year.

The group of the Americas has the objective to improve the capability to apply risk analysis in the region, by developing a strategy for training. In this regard, the manual will prove to be important.

The Ad Hoc group's work on the manual and this group's work are complementary and should promote both better communication and interaction. Communication with the president of the group of the manual should be established in order to obtain a final draft.

The Regional Commission of the Americas group will continue to implement the training strategy, which entails the development of training materials, which will be based on the principles of the code, and the manual as soon as it is finalized. The interrelationship between the Collaborating Center in Fort Collins, the group of Regional Commission, and the Collaborating Center in Teramo will be promoted to enhance the process. At the same time, the group should be able to develop concrete models to be used by the countries. Everything will be disseminated through the group's web site.

### **Web Site Presentation**

The group's web site was demonstrated emphasizing recent additions, in particular the references from the literature. The group has promised to send new references that they consider to be pertinent. These materials will be reviewed by the group before they are posted on the web page.

Access to the web page has been agreed to be public knowledge, providing authorization from the Regional Commission of the Americas and the OIE Central Office.

### **Revision of agreements from the last meeting**

The results from the survey that was carried out by the OIE Regional Representation of the Americas were presented. The survey was given to all the countries and only eight countries answered. One country mentioned that they did not use risk analysis techniques. However, all the countries mentioned the need to receive technical assistance on the subject.

The action items from the last meeting were reviewed.

### **Training**

A proposal was made to organize courses at the sub-regional level that would maximize the impact and deal with specific subjects of interest for the each sub region. The actions should be in line with the context of the OIE strategy plan.

A training event was conducted for the MERCOSUR region in Uruguay at the end of last year. More than 50 people participated from Uruguay, Paraguay, and Brazil.

Another event was held in Mexico with the participation of OPS-Panaftosa. The objective was to strengthen the risk analysis group. This course was taught at an advanced level (3rd and 4th level).

Previous to this meeting, a course was conducted for the OIRSA region covering the concepts of basic epidemiology and risk analysis. Veterinarians from Mexico, Guatemala, Belize, Honduras, El Salvador, Nicaragua, Costa Rica, and Panama participated.

In August of this year, a two-week course will be held in Spanish at Fort Collins, Colorado corresponding to the 3rd and 4th level of surveillance and risk analysis.

Various countries do not have risk analysis units. However, all countries have disease surveillance units and importation programs. A strategy could be to strengthen the ties between these units in order to develop risk analysis. The group emphasizes the necessity for countries to have qualified personnel who work in programs related to importation in which risk analysis has practical applications. These people can be in within risk analysis units or in other areas.

An area for collaboration for Teramo and Fort Collins could be in the utilization and development of modular courses in epidemiology that Teramo has developed. The modules have to be translated into Spanish, completed or possibly developed with multimedia presentations that can be accessed over the Internet.

### **The Group's Future**

The group needs to plan to define the medium term strategy. Before the group becomes directly involved in more specific topics, it must communicate its results and increase training activities.

Training is one of the priorities of the working group. The group should develop the courses and materials for training.

The group should continue to develop the conceptual application of risk analysis, reviewing risk management, and risk communication topics.

The group will develop a generic model for BSE country freedom recognition. The group members will send the studies conducted to date and Panaftosa will propose a model for use in the region with the agreement of the group. The model will be presented at the next meeting of the Regional Commission for the Americas.

Colombia had officially requested to participate in the group's meetings, the group accepted this addition. The OIE Regional Office will communicate this decision to ICA of Colombia.

### Strategy to disseminate the group's work

The group can take advantage of regional fora in order to present a summary of the group's work.

Different communication activities identifies are:

- Informative note to the Regional Commission of the Americas and the OIE's Director General on the group's work and the interrelations with the manual group.
- A presentation at the next Regional Conference of the Regional Commission of the Americas in Chile on March 2002 giving a summary of activities and the development of the web page.
- Promote in the countries the use of the group's web page (Promed, Saninet, others)
- Establish a link between the OIE web page and the Regional representation of the Americas web page.

### Reminders

Request the Manual working group for a draft copy	Cristóbal Zepeda
Send correspondence to the Regional Commission of the Americas and the OIE General Director informing them of the activities of the group and relations with the Ad Hoc manual group	Emilio Gimeno Cristóbal Zepeda
Economic references	Ken Forsythe John Green
Identify within the existing references on the web site relevant sections highlighting each topic	The whole group
The group members will provide risk analysis studies developed for BSE in their respective countries.	The whole group The 1 <sup>st</sup> week of July
Panaftosa will compile the studies and devise a model that reflects the common aspects of the studies	Alejandro López
Invite Colombia ICA for the incorporation of Mairo Urbina to become members of the group	Emilio Gimeno